

**Chair**

DAGMAR NIEBUR  
Dept. of ECE  
Drexel University  
3141 Chestnut Street  
Philadelphia, PA 19104  
Tel: 1-215-895-6749  
Fax: 1-215-895-1695  
[niebur@drexel.edu](mailto:niebur@drexel.edu)

**Vice-Chair**

JOYDEEP MITRA  
Dept. of ECE  
Michigan State University  
428 S Shaw Ln, EB 2120  
East Lansing, MI 48824  
Tel: 1-517-353-8528  
Fax: 1-517-353-1980  
[mitraj@msu.edu](mailto:mitraj@msu.edu)

**Secretary**

ALEX SCHNEIDER  
Quanta Technology  
1200 Roosevelt Rd. Ste. 300  
Glen Ellyn, Illinois 60137  
Tel: 1-630-613-3395  
[aschneider@quanta-  
technology.com](mailto:aschneider@quanta-technology.com)

**Past Chair**

Sandoval Carneiro JR.  
Depto Instituto de Tecnologia Vale  
Professor Emeritus  
Federal Univ. of Rio de Janeiro  
Tel: 55-21-3980-7442  
Tel: 55-21-9202-5622  
[sandoval.carneiro@vale.com](mailto:sandoval.carneiro@vale.com)  
[sandocarneiro@gmail.com](mailto:sandocarneiro@gmail.com)

**IEEE-PES-PSACE Committee Main Meeting  
General Meeting 2012**

Wednesday, July 25, 2012, 9:00 a.m. – 12:00 p.m.  
Manchester Grand Hyatt, Room Betsy C

**Meeting Minutes**

1. Chair Sandoval Carneiro opened the meeting at 9:05, welcomed the members and called for introductions. Those present introduced themselves. The attendance sheet is attached.
2. The meeting agenda was modified by Vice-Chair Dagmar Niebur and unanimously approved in the modified form. Alex Schneider noted a typographical error in the minutes of the GM 2011 meeting and the minutes were unanimously approved in the corrected form.
3. Approval of Policies and Procedures (P&P) Manual: Secretary Joydeep Mitra explained the role and relevance of the P&P Manual. It was suggested that the members review the draft in its present form and provide feedback to Joydeep by Monday, July 30, 2012. The comments that Germano Lambert Torres had emailed were noted. It was voted on and agreed by the SC that the present draft, with the feedback received by July 30 be submitted to the Audit Committee for review.
4. TCPC Report on T&D 2012 Conference by Karen Miu: Karen Miu is waiting for exact statistics to be provided by Maria Proetto at the Technical Sessions meeting. Rough numbers are about 40 papers submitted and about 50% accepted. A panel with 5 papers including 1 transaction paper took place and was very well attended with an average of 50 attendants.
5. TCPC Report on GM 2012 Conference by Dagmar:

PSACE has received a total of over 340 papers, among the 98 conference papers. Since conference papers are submitted by subcommittee and sometimes reassigned to other committees, tracking of the exact number at any given point during the review process is difficult. However, the number of panel papers is reasonable well known and the number as reflected in the actual statistics provided by the Technical Council. The statistics shown in Appendix A however only show the number of accepted and rejected papers. Those withdrawn by the system, after authors fail to resubmit a mandatory revision are lumped together with papers withdrawn for other reasons such as incomplete

submission or duplicate submission. Thus the statistics do not accurately reflect the actual number of submitted papers and the rejection rate underestimates the number of not accepted papers; see also a more detailed explanation in Appendix B confirmed through an email exchange with Maria Proetto in October 2012.

Keeping this in mind, and based on the statistics provided by the Technical Council, PSACE has received 19% of all accepted and rejected conference papers, 27% of all transaction papers, and 17% of all panel papers. The conference paper rejection rate for the GM was 22% ranging from 0%-50%; PSACE's rate was 26.67%, the 5<sup>th</sup> lowest of all committees (including 3 that only received 5, 7 and 12 papers respectively). PSACE Subcommittee rates varied between 22.2% and 33.3%. Additional data are provided in Appendix A.

TCPC for GM 2013 will be Kevin Schneider.

## 6. Subcommittee and Other Entity Reports

### a. Computing and Analytical Methods SubCommittee (Manimaran):

CAMS had the following sessions and meetings at the PES GM 2012.

- 1) CAMS subcommittee had its meeting
- 2) Poster Session -- CAMS had about 20 papers
- 3) Paper Forum – CAMS had ~23 papers in the paper forum
- 4) TF CIM had organized a tutorial and panel session, and task force meeting
- 5) TF Cyber security organized a panel session, and task force meeting
- 6) TF Cascading failure organized a panel session and task force meeting
- 7) TF Open source software organized task force meeting
- 8) TF High Performance Computing task force organized a combo session

Recommendations made at the CAMS Subcommittee meeting.

- 1) Supporting one panel per task force and making this request to PSACE
- 2) Make a request to covert Cascading failure TF into a working group (WG)
- 3) Creation of new TF Big Data-driven Analytics for Grid Operations
- 4) Extend the time for CAMS subcommittee meeting from 2hours to 3hours, of which half-time have technical presentation and discussion, then the remaining half-time have the subcommittee meeting.
- 5) The following six panel proposals requests are made to PSACE (and also attend PSACE meeting) for PES GM 2013.

Six panel proposals for PES GM 2013.

- The use of CIM standards in Smart Grid applications
- Understanding, Prediction, Prevention and Restoration of Cascading Failures Cyber Security of WAMPAC

- Big Data-driven Analytics for Grid Operations
  - Open Source tools for Smart Grid application
  - Algorithms and Tools for managing future power systems
- 6) One tutorial proposal for PES GM 2013 – from CIM TF

The panel proposals and tutorial proposal was submitted to PSACE. If needed, it can be submitted again.

- b. Intelligent Systems SubCommittee (Alexandre P. Alves Da Silva)
- i. SC meeting on Monday, July 23, was very well attended
  - ii. GM 2012 Activity: 4 panels (Modern Heuristic Optimization, Multi-Agent Systems, Intelligent Control Systems, and Data Mining) and 1 paper forum (with 20 papers)
  - iii. Future activities planned:
    - GM 2013: 5 panels (one co-sponsored) and 2 tutorials
    - T&D 2014: A panel on “Smart condition monitoring and SCADA mining for smart grids”
    - GM 2014: A panel on “Data mining for power market regulatory issues”
  - iv. Officer election/elevation: Alexandre P. Alves da Silva and Zita A. Vale are the newly appointed Chair and Vice-Chair, respectively. A call to fulfill the technical secretary vacancy has been announced.
- c. Reliability, Risk and Probability Applications SubCommittee (Panida Jirutitijaroen, RRPA Secretary):
- i. Activities: 1 panel session, 1 combo session, and 1 paper forum:
    - Tuesday, July 24, 2012*
      - 13:00 - 17:00 Panel Session *Practical Aspects of Probability Applications for Common Mode and Dependent Outage Events in Electric Power Systems* Edward B -TS
    - Wednesday, July 25, 2012*
      - 8:00 - 12:30 Combo Session *Generation adequacy assessment: Computation methods and capacity value of solar* Manchester D -TS
    - Thursday, July 26, 2012*
      - 08:00 - 12:00 Paper Forum *Reliability, Risk and Probability Application* Manchester E -TS
  - ii. WG/TF Activity: The following entities met during the GM 2012:
    - Task Force on Reliability of Task Force on "Distribution System Reliability – development of test systems; Chair: Lina Bertling

- Task Force on Reliability Consideration in Emerging Cyber-Physical Electrical Energy Systems; Chair: Alejandro Dominguez-Garcia
  - Task Force on Probability Applications for Common Mode Events in Electric Power; Chair: Milorad Papic
  - Working Group on Loss of Load Expectation Best Practices; Chair: Andy Ford
- d. Distribution System Analysis SubCommittee (Sukumar Brahma)
- i. SC meeting on Tuesday, July 24 2012, 1 – 2 PM. About 15 attendees
  - ii. DSA activities for 2011-2012:
    - Panel Sessions at T&D 2012, Orlando, FL:
      1. Short Circuit Analysis of IEEE Test Feeders
      2. Issues in Distribution System Analysis
    - Sessions at GM 2012, San Diego, CA:
      1. Poster Session: Monday 23<sup>rd</sup>, 5:7 pm, 1st Level - Douglas Pavilion ABCD - Kevin Schneider.
      2. Paper Forum: Thursday 26<sup>th</sup>, 8 am to 12 pm, 2nd Level - Manchester I - Kevin Schneider.
      3. Panel Session: Challenges in Distribution System State Estimation, Wednesday, 25<sup>th</sup>, 8 AM to 12 PM, 2<sup>nd</sup> Level - Manchester A - Chaired by Bikash Pal.
      4. Panel Session: Control Algorithms for Distribution Systems, Wednesday, 25<sup>th</sup>, 1-5 pm, 2<sup>nd</sup> Level - Manchester C - Chaired by Kevin Schneider.
  - iii. Proposed Panel Sessions for GM 2013 - Tentative.
    - Topics on Distribution System Analysis: Greg Shirek
    - Impact of Plugin Hybrid Electric Vehicles (PHEV) on Distribution Systems: Sarika Khushalani-Solanki.
  - iv. DSA Paper acceptance rates for GM 12: 67%.
  - v. Other comments:
    1. New Task Force on Load Modeling: Proposed by Kevin Schneider
    2. DG planning and optimization taskforce led by Andrew Keane: Completed their work and submitted a Transaction paper. Current status of paper: Revised and Resubmitted.
    3. Rotation of Officers Effective end of GM 2012. Chair: Kevin, VC: Greg, S: Sarika
    4. DSA TCPC for GM 2013, 2014 – Greg Shirek
    5. DSA representative on PSACE WG on awards – Kevin Schneider.
- e. System Economics SubCommittee (Kwok Cheung presented on behalf of Francois Bouffard)
- i. Kwok Cheung (Vice-Chair) and Ning Lu (Secretary) conducted the System Economics SubCommittee meeting on behalf of Francois Bouffard due to his paternity absence.
  - ii. GM 2012 Activity: 5 panel sessions, one paper forum, one poster forum.

- iii. The SC meeting was attended by 31 members
- iv. WG/TF Activity: 5 WGs and 1 TF met during the GM 2012
  - A Prize Paper WG led by Chris Mensah Bonsu; the WG has nominated and recommended 10 papers to be considered for prize paper awards.
  - Some concerns were expressed regarding the transparency of the prize paper award process. It was not very clear to the Prize Paper WG and the SC as a whole about the selection progress as well as the evaluation process.
- v. A new WG on economics of storage was formed and was led by Ning Lu and Peter Son.
- vi. SES website revamp – SES website has not been updated for at least three years. Francois has attempted many times for the past couple years. Currently, IEEE can host sites using the WordPress blog platform. Francois is currently migrating and updating the data of our SES website on that particular platform.

## 7. PSACE Officer Reports

*Chair Sandoval Carneiro*

Rep to Planning: Meeting takes place in parallel to the main PSACE meeting, thus no report.

*Vice-Chair Dagmar Niebur*

- a. Rep to Awards: Technical Council Awards meeting took place on Tuesday 4-5 pm. The chair Dr. Ramakumar announced that he had stepped down in 2011. Rick Taylor has been appointed as interim chair. The Technical Council awards will be announced at the technical Council Meeting on Wednesday afternoon.
- b. Rep to Technical Sessions

The Technical Council Technical Sessions Committee Meetings took place twice in person and numerous times through conference calls. DN attended the meetings in Anaheim on January 9, 2013 and at the GM 2012 on 7/24/2013 in person. She also participated in the majority of conference calls. Meeting minutes are available from the technical secretary Mani Venkata or from DN; the Committee has plans to post these on the newly designed PES web page.

Technical program information for PSACE has been discussed in the TCPC report by DN, see agenda item 5 as well as Appendix A and B.

The presentation of the new conference format for the GM 2014 has been moved to agenda item 11 a. below.

- c. Rep to Meetings & Marketing

The Technical Council Meetings & Marketing Committee Meetings took place twice in person. DN attended both the meetings in Anaheim on January 9, 2013 and at the GM 2012 on 7/24/2013. The goal of the committee is to encourage and support promotion of meeting as well as committee and working group activities. To this effect, efforts to list subcommittees (as already done by PSACE) as well as working groups on the PSACE Technical activity web page were discussed. Avenues to post technical reports of committee activities as well as publicizing them through news letter will be explored.

For 2014 T&D Committee coordination the roles of the following organizing committees were defined

- LOC will control super sessions coordinated with TCPCS.
- TC Vice-Chair and TCPCs will handle poster sessions.

Action items for PSACE include

- the submission of the annual report
- update the subcommittee, working group and task force web pages

#### *Technical Secretary*

Rep to Organization & Proc: The meeting occurred from 8–10 a.m. Tuesday, July 24. Two items were discussed that concerned the PSACE:

- a. Every Committee needed to submit their draft P&P (Policies and Procedures) manuals for approval otherwise they would forfeit their ability to develop Standards. The draft of the PSACE P&P has been made available for members to review and provide comments by July 30, as noted in item 3 above.
- b. Every Committee needed to update their Officer information on the Technical Council's roster and submit it to Mani Venkata.

#### *Past Chair*

Fellows Coordinator Past chair Kevin Tomsovic was unable to attend today's meeting and asked Vice Chair Dagmar Niebur to report the following items:

- PSACE has received not a single request for endorsement of nominations in the past 12 months.
- A request to the Technical Council to review the process of fellow nominations and committee endorsement should be made at the Technical Council meeting on 7/25/2013.

#### 8. Committee Liaison Reports

- a. Rep to Stds Coordinating Committee - Andrew P. Ford – A draft of the new P&P has been submitted to PSACE for comments and vote, see agenda item 3 above.

- b. Rep to Emerging Technologies Committee      Stephen McArthur not present – no report
- c. Intelligent Grid Coordinating Committee      Edwin Liu (present) & Karen Miu (excused)  
– no report
- d. Wind Power Coordinating      Mark O'Malley, not present, no report
- e. The Marine Systems Coordinating Committee has no PSACE representative

9. PSACE Member Recognition and Awards WG

A new administrative PSACE WG has met for the first time on Monday 7/23/2013. The objectives of the WG are to streamline the award nomination process for PSACE, Technical Council, PES and IEEE awards and recognize and promote PSACE contributors and members at the PES and IEEE level. Each subcommittee should be presented by at least one member. The SES Committee has a prize paper WG and delegated Dr. Mensah-Bonsu to present SES. RPPS was presented by chair Lina Bertling, CAMS by vice-chair Manimaran Govindarasu, and DAS by Kevin Schneider. The WG worked through the list of available awards and designated award nomination responsibilities to the subcommittees according to the subcommittee scopes. Action items included to identify nomination procedures and deadlines which may differ for individual awards, identify worthy professionals and procure nominations and references for these individuals and organize the submission of nominations.

10. Miscellaneous items - None

11. New business

a. New meetings structure

Vice-chair and TCPC Dagmar Niebur informed the PSACE attendants about the new paper review, panel session and GM format that will first be implemented for the General Meeting 2013 and has been announced on the Call For Papers. The change is driven by two objectives: to avoid a large number of parallel sessions by limiting conference paper contributions to 4 paper for a and 1 poster session, to increase presentation quality by inviting authors of peer-reviewed transaction papers and to provide panelists with the opportunity to present more timely results without the burden of paper writing.

Among the major changes are the following:

1. The paper length has been reduced to 4 pages. (Note this was modified to 5 pages in Fall 2012)
2. There will be no paper sessions. The best 60-80 papers (selected by the TCPCs who will receive a number of slots proportional to the submission level to the committee) will be presented in 4 paper fora and subsequently also presented in the poster

session. A few of the top 60 to 80 conference papers will be chosen and recognized as General Meeting Conference Prize Papers. These papers and authors will be acknowledged at the Tuesday night Awards Dinner.

3. There will be paper quotas for conference papers. The exact number will depend on the number of submissions and the availability of space for posters. (Note: In January 2013 this number was set to 50% for all committees receiving more than 40 papers.)
4. There are no more panel papers. Panel sessions do not require the submission of a panel paper or panel abstract. If presenters wish to submit a paper on the presentation topic, this paper will be treated as a conference paper. It will undergo anonymous peer review and may be rejected based on quality as well as paper quotas.
5. Panel presentations will be uploaded to a central website prior to the conference and will be made available online to GM participants (and potentially the general public.)
6. Panel slots will be allocated per subcommittee based on prior panel session activity. PSACE has 15 panels at the GM 2012 and thus has received 14 panel slots for the GM 2013.
7. Submission of IEEE Transaction paper abstract with subsequent paper presentation at the conference will be encouraged. Fourteen 4h session slots have been allocated for Transaction papers published in special issues of the five PES IEEE Transactions. Vice-president for publications Saifur Rahman is in charge of organizing these sessions.

An additional fourteen 4h session slots have been allocated for “other” PES IEEE Transaction papers. Technical Sessions Committee chair Mani Venkata will work with the five editors-in-chief to organize these sessions.

During the subsequent discussion identified the following benefits and concerns:

- + shorter papers may be faster to review
- + shorter papers may allow authors to submit more detailed transaction paper avoiding duplication of already published material
- + panelist had complained about PSACE’s more stringent panel paper review process and in particular industry experts are welcoming the opportunity to provide more timely presentations without paper writing pressure
- All newly emerging intellectual activity is reduced to one 4h poster session plus a potential 8 minute presentation where authors need to stand next to their own work without being able to discuss their peers work



- In the age of smart grids new communities from computer, communication and controls are interacting with power system research to make interdisciplinary contributions,. However in order to present their approaches these researchers will have to work several years in the field and publish a transaction paper. This is counter-productive to stimulating collaborative research at the frontiers of knowledge.
- The character of this meeting will change from a vibrant research and practice-oriented meeting to a meeting where experts who know each other talk to each other. Junior participants and experts not already connected to this network are only offered an opportunity to report on their work during the Monday afternoon sessions.
- Instead of welcoming the surge in new approaches and new audiences, PES has chosen to raise the bar thus strongly discouraging the contribution of intriguingly novel though sometimes immature (thus conference-worthy but not journal paper worthy) work.

Because of time constraints and since the changes are already implemented, the discussion was stopped. PSACE will implement the Technical Council policies and will evaluate successes and/or failures of these policies after the GM 2013.

b. PSACE interaction in international conferences

The RRPA subcommittee expressed concern that the frequency of annual subcommittee meetings is insufficient to perform committee work in a timely manner. The subcommittee has previously met at PMAAPS and will continue to do so. The vice-chair mentioned the possibility to conduct additional business at the Joint Committee Meetings organized by the technical council in January of each year. A block of rooms is reserved for these meetings and a registration fee is usually imposed to cover rooms and potentially audio-visuals and coffee breaks.

12. There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at.11:40 pm.

Minutes submitted by  
Dagmar Neibur, PSACE Vice-Chair, and  
Joydeep Mitra, PSACE Secretary

## Appendix A

### Paper and Session Statistics for the GM 2012

Note that the number of total papers is calculated as the sum of accepted papers and rejected papers. The papers submitted, but not resubmitted after a revise and resubmit decision are lumped together with the papers withdrawn for other reasons. Thus the calculation of the rejection rate is flawed, see also Appendix B.

**Table 1: Number of Transaction Papers Submitted and Accepted per Committee**

1 Committee	2 Total	3 Accepted
(PSACE) Computer Analytical Methods	7	7
(PSACE) Distribution System Analysis	5	5
(PSACE) Economic Systems	4	4
(PSACE) Intelligent Systems	3	3
(PSACE) Reliability and Risk Analysis	4	4
<b>PSACE</b>	<b>11</b>	<b>11</b>
Electric Machinery	6	6
Emerging Technologies Coordinating	1	1
Energy Development and Power Generation	4	4
Intelligent Grid Coordinating	1	1
Power System Communications	3	3
Power System Dynamic Performance	13	13
Power System Operations	9	9
Power System Planning and Implementation	4	4
Power System Relaying	4	4
Stationary Battery	1	1
Switchgear	1	1
Transmission and Distribution	7	7
<b>PSACE All Transaction Papers</b>	<b>34</b>	<b>34</b>
<b>Other Committees All Transaction Papers</b>	<b>88</b>	<b>88</b>

**Table 2: Number of Accepted and Rejected Conference Papers Submitted to PSACE Subcommittees Excludes Papers Not Resubmitted after a Revise/Resubmit Decision**

4	Committee	5	Total	6	Accepted	7	Rejected	8	% Rejete d
9	(PSACE) Computer Analytical Methods	10	36	11	28	12	8	13	22.20%
14	(PSACE) Distribution System Analysis	15	39	16	27	17	12	18	30.80%
19	(PSACE) Economic Systems	20	43	21	31	22	12	23	27.90%
24	(PSACE) Intelligent Systems	25	33	26	24	27	9	28	27.30%
29	(PSACE) Reliability and Risk Analysis	30	33	31	22	32	11	33	33.30%
34	PSACE	35	11	36	11	37	0	38	0.00%

**Table 3 Number of Accepted and Rejected Conference Papers Submitted to All Technical Committees Excludes Papers Not Resubmitted after a Revise/Resubmit Decision**

39 Committee	40 Total	41 Accepted	Rejected	% of All GM 2012 Proceedings Papers	% Rejected
<b>PSACE Total</b>	195	143	52	19%	26.67%
<b>Power System Operations</b>	183	166	17	18%	9.30%
<b>Power System Dynamic Performance</b>	133	101	32	13%	24.10%
<b>Energy Development and Power Generation</b>	114	57	57	11%	50.00%
<b>Transmission and Distribution</b>	106	92	14	10%	13.20%
<b>Power System Planning and Implementation</b>	66	51	15	6%	22.70%
<b>Intelligent Grid Coordinating</b>	60	50	10	6%	16.70%
<b>Power System Relaying</b>	44	36	8	4%	18.20%
<b>Power System Instrumentation and Measurements</b>	23	17	6	2%	26.10%
<b>Power System Communications</b>	19	19	0	2%	0.00%
<b>Emerging Technologies Coordinating</b>	18	14	4	2%	22.20%
<b>Electric Machinery</b>	17	15	2	2%	11.80%
<b>Transformers</b>	12	6	6	1%	50.00%
<b>Stationary Battery</b>	7	5	2	1%	28.60%
<b>Substations</b>	5	5	0	0%	0.00%
<b>Power &amp; Energy Education</b>	4	2	2	0%	50.00%
<b>Marine Systems Coordinating</b>	4	3	1	0%	25.00%
<b>Switchgear</b>	4	3	1	0%	25.00%
<b>Insulated Conductors</b>	2	2	0	0%	0.00%
<b>TOTALS</b>	<b>1016</b>	<b>787</b>	<b>229</b>	<b>100%</b>	<b>22.54%</b>
<b>max</b>	195.00	166.00	57.00	0.19	50.00%
<b>min</b>	2.00	2.00	0.00	0.00	0.00%
<b>average</b>	53.47	41.42	12.05	0.05	22.08%
<b>stdev</b>	62.70	49.94	16.99	0.06	15%
<b>TOTALS</b>	<b>1016</b>	<b>787</b>	<b>229</b>	<b>100%</b>	<b>22.54%</b>

**Table 4: Types and Number of Sessions per Committee for the GM 2013**

<b>Sessions Type</b>	<b>Number</b>	<b>of Sessions</b>
<b>Panels</b>	15	
<b>Paper For a</b>	5	
<b>Poster</b>	1	or 4 subcommittee sessions
<b>Combo</b>	2	
<b>Committee</b>	33	
<b>Tutorial</b>	1	
<b>Supersession</b>	2	

## Appendix B

### Overly Conservative Paper Statistics for all General Meetings

The calculation of the rejection rate is overly conservative for all committees for at least the GM 2016-2012. It in fact overestimates the ratio of accepted papers to submitted papers.

Currently the rejection rate is calculated as follows:

$$1. \text{ Rejection\_rate} = \text{rejected\_papers}/(\text{accepted} + \text{rejected papers})$$

While it should be computed as

$$2. \text{ Rejection\_rate} = (\text{rejected} + \text{not-resubmitted papers})/ (\text{accepted} + \text{rejected} + \text{not-resubmitted papers})$$

or alternatively

$$\text{Acceptance\_rate} = \text{accepted\_papers}/\text{all\_submitted\_papers}$$

(aka all submitted papers excluding double submissions and incomplete papers)

The Mirasmart System does not take into account the revise and resubmit papers that are withdrawn.

Thus accepted and rejected papers add up to the “total” number of papers, although the actual number of submitted papers is higher.

I confirmed this in an email exchange in October 2012 with Maria Proetto. I copied the technical council leadership but did not receive a reply. I also mentioned it at the Technical Session Meeting in Memphis, January 2013, but it was not discussed,

Example for the case of the reviewed panel papers:

**Table 5: Panel Paper Statistics for the GM 2013 –  
Excludes Papers Not Resubmitted after a Revise/Resubmit Decision**

<b>Committee</b>	<b>Total</b>	<b>Accepted</b>	<b>Rejected</b>	<b>Rejection Rate</b>
<b>Electric Machinery</b>	31	30	1	3%
<b>Energy Development and Power Generation</b>	111	109	2	2%
<b>Intelligent Grid Coordinating</b>	1	1	0	0%
<b>PES Super Session</b>	21	21	0	0%
<b>Power &amp; Energy Education</b>	25	25	0	0%
<b>Power System Dynamic Performance</b>	30	29	1	3%
<b>Power System Instrumentation and Measurements</b>	9	9	0	0%
<b>Power System Operations</b>	48	48	0	0%
<b>Power System Planning and Implementation</b>	29	26	3	10%
<b>PSACE</b>	74	70	4	5%
<b>Substations</b>	1	1	0	0%
<b>Transmission and Distribution</b>	36	26	10	28%
<b>Wind Power Coordinating</b>	19	18	1	5%
<b>Total</b>	<b>435</b>	<b>413</b>	<b>22</b>	<b>5%</b>

**Table 6: PSACE Panel Paper Statistics for the GM 2013 –  
Includes Papers Not Resubmitted after a Revise/Resubmit Decision**

		<b>Total Submitted</b>	<b>Accepted</b>	<b>Rejected</b>	<b>Not resubmitted</b>	<b>Acceptance Rate</b>
<b>Panel Paper</b>	PSACE	98	70	4	14	71%

Thus the 29% of the papers (instead of 5%) were judged as not acceptable for the conference after original submission or resubmission. The PSACE panel paper example was chosen because the actual number of submitted papers was scheduled by the panel organizers and thus fixed and known for PSACE.

Conference papers on the other hand are a moving target, since in the initial phase of the review process they may be reassigned to other committees or withdrawn by the authors for reasons unrelated to the review process. And again, the number of papers not resubmitted by the authors after the revise and resubmit decision is not reported by the system and thus unknown for 2012.

Note: The new IEEE PES Policy issued for the GM 2013 does not require any panel paper submission. Authors who wish to submit a paper shall submit it as a regular conference paper.